## United States Court of Appeals for the Second Circuit



**APPENDIX** 

# 76-2098

UNITED STATES COURT OF APPEALS FOR THE SECOND CIRCUIT

PEDRO ARROYO and CHRISTOPHER McCORMACK,

Plaintiffs-Appellants,

-against-

PETER M. SCHAEFER, Former Deputy Warden in :
Command; RALPH SUMOWITZ and PATRICK MAGNER, No. 76-2098
Assistant Deputy Wardens; KENNETH FERGUSON, :
CONSTANTINE MELLON and PAUL FELTMAN,
Captains; JOSEPH OCHMANN and ROY SCHUH, :
Correction Officers; and DR. KARP, Institutional Physician, :

Defendant-Appellees.

B

#### APPENDIX

WILLIAM E. HELLERSTEIN
MARJORIE M. SMITH
Attorneys for Plaintiffs-Appellants
The Legal Aid Society
Prisoners' Rights Project
15 Park Row - 19th Floor
New York, New York 10038
[212] 577-3530



#### TABLE OF CONTENTS

Docket Entries	
Pro Se Complaint of Pedro Arroyo	
Pro Se Complaint of Christopher McCormack	2
Amended Complaintl	2
Judgment of July 23, 1976	0
Notice of Appeal	0

2:C.4751 & 72 C. 4771 are CIVIL DOCKET for al purposes. Knapp, J UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT Jury demand date: 72 11. . C. Form No. 106 Rev. ATTORNEYS For plaintiff: PEDRO ARROYO RO ARROYO, JERRY THOMAS, CHRISTOPHER 125 White Street DAMACK, LANCSTON DERNIE, NYC 10013 Plaintiffs, -against-JAMIN MALCOLM, Commissioner of Correction the City of New York, ARTHUR HUBIN, Worden: hattan House of Derention for Hen, PETER SCRAEFER, Former Deputy Warden in Command,: PH SUMOWITZ and PATRICK MAGNUR, Assistant uty Wardens, KINDATH FERGUSON, CONSTAUTINE: LON and PAUL FELTUAM, Captains, JOSEPH MANN and ROY SCHUE, Correction Officers, KARP, Institutional Physician, and John S #1-10, Correction Officers, Manhattan se of Detention for Men, For defendant: WILLIAM HELLERSTEIN Defendants. Legal Aid Society Prisoners Rights Project 115 Fifth Ave NYC (for deft) STATISTICAL RECORD MAME OR . COSTS REC DISB. ECEIPT NO S. 5 mailed Clerk 5. 6 mailed 67-23 -76 Marshal sis of Action: Viblation of Docket fee il Rights 42 USC 1983 Witness fees tion arose at: Depositions The state of the s

### JUDGE KNAPP.

PRO SE

* * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * *	
PROCEEDINGS	Date Order or Judgment Noted
Complaint andissued summons.	
Filed Order that petitioner is permitted to proceed in forma pauperis without	
prepayment of fees. EDFISTEIN.J.	
Filed Summons and entered marshal's return served on Manhattan House of	
Petention for Men on 11-15-72. Filed dert's notice of motion Re: dismissal ret 12-29-72.	
filed dert's notice of motion Re: dismissal ret 12-29-72.	
Filed dert's memorandum of law in support of motion for dismissal.	
Filed Order that the deft having moved to dismiss the complaints	
per to Rule 12(b) the court hereby appoints Wm. Hellerstein,	
Legal Aid Society, Prisoners' Rights Project, 119 Fifth Ave,	
N.Y.C. to represent pltffs in these actions and directs that	
oral argument on deft's motion be heard on 1-26-73 at 2:00PM.	KNAPP, J.
(also in 72Civ4750,72Civ4751 and 72 Civ 4771)	
Filed Beft. answers to pltf. interrogatories.	
Filed affidavit of Pedro Arroyo in opposition to deft's motion for,	
Filed dert's amended notice of motion granting summary judgment	¥ 1.
filed Memo Endorsed on deft's motion Re: Summary Judgment: Motion .	-1
denied for the reasons stated in open court on 4-5-74; Knapp. J.	
Filed Pltffs Amended Complaint. Summons Issued.	
Filed Suppl.Summons.Served:	
Benjamin Malcolm, Commissioner of Correction by Mr. Husband, Leg-	<u> </u>
al Div.on 4/18/74	<u> </u>
Arthur Rubin, Warden, Manhattan House of Detention by Jim Hicke	t V
Depy Dir. of Operations on 4/18/74	1
Ralph Sumowitz by Jim Hickey on 4/18/74	<u>-</u>
Patrick Magner by " " " " " "	
Kenneth Ferguson by" " " " "	<del> </del>
Constantine Mellon by Mr. Husbands, Legal Div. 4/18/74	7.
Paul Feltman by Jim Hickey, Depy Dir. Operations, 4/18/74	·
Joseph Ochman by " " " " " " " " "	<del>                                     </del>
Roy Schuh	<b> </b>
Dr. Karp "" " " " " " "	
Filed AMSWER to Amended complaint by deft; s Malcolm Rubin, Scharfer,	A D D
Sumovitz. Magner, Ferguson, Mellon Feltman, Ochmann, & Schub.	A.F.3.
iled pltff's affidavit & notice of motion to compell deft's to	
produce documents ret. 6-21-74.	
Filed pltff's memorandum of law in support of motion ret.6-21-74.	<del> </del>
Filed "Suppl. Interrogs to Dity. Schaefer, Camowitz, Magner, Ferguson, Fellon.	· · · · · · ·
Feltman, Cohmanny Schuh and Karp.	-
iled Order that deft's shall on or before 8-21-74 permit pitff's ,	<del>                                     </del>
counsel to inspect & copy each & every one of the documents,	
so requested a serve & file a full & complete answer to interm	pgs.,
as indicated, Knapp, J.	
iled Hemorandum & order #41085: In compliance with our order, the,	
deft's have produced the requested documents & submitted for i	n
camera inspection the department of corrections' "Emergency ,	
plan. which is designed to "cope with a disturbance or,	
I The second of	
insurrection in any area" of the Manhattan House of Detention	
insurrection in any area" of the Manhattan House of Detention.	ha
insurrection in any area" of the Manhattan House of Detention.  We have concluded that the pltff's are entitled to the following	ng,
insurrection in any area" of the Manhattan House of Detention.  We have concluded that the pltff's are entitled to the following excerpts as indicated. So ordered. Knapp.J.	ng,
insurrection in any area" of the Manhattan House of Detention.  We have concluded that the pltff's are entitled to the followi excerpts as indicated. So ordered. Knapp, J.  Filed pltff's answers to pltff's interrogs.	
insurrection in any area" of the Manhattan House of Detention.  We have concluded that the pltff's are entitled to the following excerpts as indicated. So ordered. Knapp.J.	

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

Civ 4724 Pedro Arroyo, etal vs. Peter Schaeffer, etal Knapp, J. 72 Civ

	DATE	PROCEEDINGS
	How 1-74	PAGE #2 Filed deft's interrogs addressed to each of the pltff's.
	Nov. 1-74	Filed deft.J.Ochmann answers to interrogs.
1.	Nov. 1-74	Filed deft.C. Mellon answers to interrogs. Filed deft. P.M.Schaefer answers to interrogs.
1. 7	100.1-74	Filed deft. R.M. Schuh answers to interrogs.
	Jo . 1-74	Filed deft. R. Sumowitz answers to interrogs.
	Hov. 1-74	Filed deft.P.Feltman answers to interrogs.
	Nov. 1-74	Filed deft.P. Magner answers to interrogs.
	Dec. 11-7	4Filed deft.K.Ferguson answers to interrogs. 6Filed affidavit of M.M.Smith in support of application for a
	Jun 30-	regiled affidavit of M M Smith in support of the application for a
		writ of habeas corpus for Christopher McCormack.
	Jul. 12-7	Saefore Knapp, J. Jury trial begun.
100	Jul.13	75 Trial continued.
10	Jul.14-	75 " & case dismissed.
	Jul. 23-	Diff's THOMAS & DENNIS is dismissed for failure to prosecute
		1 - and sint on bonalt of Diffi's Alloyo & Millumana
		in the decide of discontinuous to the state of the state
		& against the dert's is dishtasted to Ent. 7-26-76.  Knapp,J. Judgment Ent. Clerk. m/n Ent. 7-26-76.
		· · ·
6		
	<u> </u>	
	-	
13.3		
	<u> </u>	

pear 30

JUDGE PIERCE

S. DISTPICT COURT

9 11 23 AH '72

S.D.OF N.Y.

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

72 CM. 4751

CHRISTOPHER McCORMACK, Plaintiff

-V-

Warden PETER SCHAEFER, Defendant.

Upon reading the annexed affidavit of Christopher

McCormack requesting that he be permitted to file his

complaint without

prepayment of fees or costs or security therefor, and it appearing to the Court that this application should be granted, it is

ORDERED, that he be and hereby is permitted to proceed in forma pauperis without prepayment of fees or costs or security therefor, in accordance with Title 28, United States Code, Section 1915(a).

Dated: New York, N. Y.

Chief Judge Many 31 C

ADREME Lour to & the State of production of 11 23 AH 17 Lhais to pher MELouingach Allegarit, of Worder Teten Desselve 72 CM. 475 M The above nomed person in this officiarit,
qives prosument to title 20, Section 1915, asking leave
to pacceed informa-parperie. The above spomed ask the cleak of this Lours, to projell Cost for this motion. Wherefore the above regrest is Confined in man hatten mens house of Leteration and hos de way of paying the fire for the alars motion. There fire the alive moned provisuar the mercy of the Court to pront this Respectfully Submittes Sween & Jalie me this 3 acy d. Oct. 1972

Lines Laber all Johnson List Lingstries warden Teter De The petition of Lines to hear of Lines to present foresty That where the plantiffindhe a love title plantiff to proceed in the store opplication in flame -This tiff mokes this application under title 42, Section 1963 of I.S. Cale, Vispile the set Hot shorting his west the beter ony of the lastes of the institution of which different is worten, we have the work to saffer the punishwest of being gossel pring source pour to his ges out landes. In Dille Ciking I'm how but Deloged and a dem let of offices the ou the flat white plantiff was Coffeed to his Coll, and from the destate the ale a menter 42 10 to graf you will see where the plantage as

Long Confined, Morning that plantiff and number of idinates with in the aced. Since the finite wwhich game tiff is long legined is without conquete Montilo time, the use of they gos under these theretoners is toutowent to Charland and such panishment, pointingely phontiff would like to wenter that you ber bein collaced in international wanters, therefore will should plantiff Le subjected de afenn of prinches thefis lastait in human & by all Civilized notions. Therefore plantiff paris that a Believe de issued, this stand for Controled to detaining the while the phatiffs Sul, and the defendant a chargen be made to port to plantiff dames in this Som of 126.110 sol that he be modet, Close inflicting the stat men tienes promehment upon plantiff and in motes. christopher McCormands

Such to falmone in this 3 what

Mobile Public, State of New York
No 03-3559500
Qualified in Brank County
Connection Expires Ward 30, 1970

Upon reading the annexed affidavit of Pedro Arroyo requesting that he be permitted to file his complaint without

prepayment of fees or costs or security therefor, and it appearing to the Court that this application should be granted, it is

ORDERED, that he be and hereby is permitted to proceed in forma pauperis without prepayment of fees or costs or security therefor, in accordance with Title 28, United States Code, Section 1915(a).

Pated: New York, N. Y.

Chief Judge

ge Illunde U. S. D. J.

JUDGE KNAPP 72 11. 4724 To the United States District Lound: Pedro arrago THEODORE E. SCOTT
Notary Public, State of New York
No. 03-3559500
Qualified in Branx County
Commission Expires Narch 30, 1973

U.S. Wis Friet Louise Color duryog Listil Lamphing Store of NEW York } ss To the United States Distaict Loudt: The petition of Feder Anoye Trespectfully offeres and Shows: 10 that sig is the Companyat in the alove ed action and That he Herically lis Request that This allow Complaint to proget while alove application in fixing powperic in this heis a soul person within die njering of fexeros Statute. is application under 12, Section 1950 of 21.5. Cola. Il Vieland appletite dales of the institution of which defendant is the warden, he has more to sugger the and a your leg of afficers Cope on the floor wheat, Goop t was, Confined, to a Coll, and defendant The arter where Complymont was long confined, They ary they bed beared in faithe let fromstes porces in the open. Sais the, & Simply was I'm lovey tenting this without colored & the retire, the diss, of the ring punder fire instance is Too tomout to constand unusual

sures hours to some the lighty Complement would Tile to ment too that that has the learn out land Wispelines Cam Sprignet plays LE made to Case in the find the alove mentioned purishment upon Complationt. Peores arroys Sucker to lelike me time 27 day Notary Public, State of New York
No. 03-3569500
Qualified in Bronx County
Commission Expires Maich 30, 1973

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

PEDRO ARROYO, JERRY THOMAS, CHRISTOPHER MCCORMACK, LANGSTON DENNIS,

#### Plaintiffs,

#### -against-

BENJAMIN MALCOLM, Commissioner of Correction of the City of New York, ARTHUR RUBIN, Warden: Manhattan House of Detention for Men, PETER M. SCHAEFER, Former Deputy Warden in Command,: RALPH SUMOWITZ and PATRICK MAGNER, Assistant Deputy Wardens, KENNETH FERGUSON, CONSTANTINE: MELLON and PAUL FELTMAN, Captains, JOSEPH OCHMANN and ROY SCHUH, Correction Officers,: DR. KARP, Institutional Physician, and JOHN DOES #1-10, Correction Officers, Manhattan: House of Detention for Men,

Defendants.

#### AMENDED COMPLAINT

#### JURISDICTION

1. Plaintiffs bring this action pursuant to 42 U.S.C. \$1983 and 28 U.S.C. \$1343 and 2201 to redress the deprivation by defendants, acting under color of state law, of plaintiffs' rights as secured by the Eighth and Fourteenth Amendments to the Constitution of the United States. Defendants are responsible for the unlawful tear gassing inflicted upon plaintiffs in September, 1972, as herein alleged with more particularity, and plaintiffs seek declaratory and injunctive relief, and punitive and compensatory damages for injuries resulting therefrom.

#### JURISDICTION

1. Plaintiffs bring this action pursuant to 42 U.S.C. \$1983 and 28 U.S.C. \$1343 and 2201 to redress the deprivation by defendants, acting under color of state law, of plaintiffs' rights as secured by the Eighth and Fourteenth Amendments to the Constitution of the United States. Defendants are responsible for the unlawful tear gassing inflicted upon plaintiffs in September, 1972, as herein alleged with more particularity, and plaintiffs seek declaratory and injunctive relief, and punitive and compensatory damages for injuries resulting therefrom.

#### PARTIES

2. Plaintiffs are each adult citizens of the United
States. At all times referred to in this complaint they were

detained at the Manhattan House of Detention for Men (the "Tombs"), New York, New York, awaiting trial on criminal charges.

3. Defendants are adult citizens of the United States and residents of the State of New York. Defendant Malcolm

- 3. Defendants are adult citizens of the United States and residents of the State of New York. Defendant Malcolm is sued individually and in his official capacity as an employee of the Department of Correction of the City of New York. Defendant Rubin is sued solely in his official capacity as an employee of the Department of Correction of the City of New York. All other defendants are sued solely in their individual capacities.
- 4. Defendant BENJAMIN J. MALCOLM, is and was at all times referred to in this complaint, Commissioner of Correction of the City of New York. He is the chief administrative officer of the New York City Department of Correction and is responsible for the maintenance and operation of all New York City correction facilities.
- 5. Defendant RUBIN is the Warden of the Tombs. As such his duties include ensuring proper care and treatment of the inmates in the Tombs and proper compliance with the rules and regulations of the Department of Correction by employees under his control. (Dept. of Corr. Rules and Regs. §3.35).
- 6. Defendant SCHAEFER was, at all times referred to in this complaint, Deputy Warden in Command of the Tombs. As such, his duties were the same as those of defendant RUBIN.
- 7. Defendants RALPH SUMOWITZ and PATRICK MAGER were, at all times referred to in this complaint, Assistant Deputy Wardens at the Tombs.

8. Defendants KENNETH FERGUSON, CONSTANTINE MELLON and PAUL FELTMAN were, at all times referred to in this complaint, Captains of the New York City Department of Correction assigned to the Tombs. 9. Defendant JOSEPH OCHMANN and ROY SCHUH were, at all times referred to in this complaint, Correction Officers in the New York City Department of Correction assigned to the Tombs. 10. Defendant KARP was, at all times referred to in this complaint, a physician retained by the New York City Department of Correction to provide medical assistance to inmates at the Tombs. 11. Defendants JOHN DOES, #1-10 were, at all times referred to in this complaint, employees of the New York City Department of Correction assigned to the Tombs who participated in the actions hereinafter alleged and whose names are unknown to plaintiffs at this time. STATEMENT OF CLAIM 12. On September 12, 1972 plaintiffs were housed in the general detainee population on the fifth floor of the Tombs, in the A section. 13. At about 12 noon on that date, all of the detainees of A section were locked in their cells except Lloyd Hughes, who remained in the lock-out corridor adjacent to the cells on the lower tier. 14. Mr. Hughes, who was being housed on the fifth floor in "punitive segregation" status, had refused to enter his -3cell unless he was given a pair of socks and permitted to make a telephone call.

- obtain Hughes' cooperation in reentering his cell, defendants MELLON and OCHMANN discharged a tear gas cannister at inmate Hughes. When he moved to avoid the gas they shifted the cannister to follow him. Clubs were also used by defendants to force Hughes into his cell.
- 16. Since plaintiff PEDRO ARROYO was housed in lower A section just opposite Hughes, the gas came into his cell. The other three plaintiffs felt the effects of the gas as it filled the entire section.
- 17. Defendants did not permit plaintiffs to leave the area where the gas was aprayed, either before or after its use.
- 18. The gas caused inter alia, a stinging sensation which brought tears to plaintiffs' eyes, made their noses run and caused a choking, constricted sensation in their throats and upper chests.
- 19. After the gassing defendants refused to open any windows despite repeated requests by plaintiffs and other detainees. Plaintiffs were not provided with changes of clothing nor were they permitted to take showers at this time.
- 20. Defendants refused to afford plaintiffs any medical attention on September 12, 1972 despite plaintiffs' repeated requests.

- 21. Upon information and belief, defendant KAPP witnessed the tear-gassing. He did not examine or assist plaintiffs in any way.
  - 22. As late as four o'clock that afternoon, the guards assigned to plaintiffs' section were still wearing gas masks to protect themselves.
- 23. As a result of the aforesaid gassing, plaintiffs suffered severe mental and emotional pain, were subjected to severe physical pain and discomfort, and received severe physical injuries.
- 24. On information and belief, tear-gas is routinely used in the Tombs by defendants and other Correction Department employees with reckless disregard for the well being of innocent bystanders such as detainees in plaintiffs' position.
- 25. Defendants knew or should have known of the unlaw-ful tear-gassing experienced by plaintiffs and all, through either reckless, willful or wrongful failure to fulfill their duties and responsibilities to plaintiffs, are directly and solely responsible for the injuries resulting from said unlawful punishment.
- 26. Defendants unnecessary and indiscriminate use of tear-gas and their failure to take subsequent measures to reduce or limit the impact of the gas upon plaintiffs deprived plaintiffs of their right to be free from cruel and unusual punishment as guaranteed by the Eighth Amendment and of their right to be free from the infliction of harm without due process of law as guaranteed by the Fourteenth Amendment.

27. There is between the parties an actual controversy and plaintiffs are threatened with irreparable injury in the future by reason of the unlawful acts of defendants. Plaintiffs have no plain or adequate remedy to redress the wrongs and unlawful acts herein complained of other than this action for declaratory and injunctive relief.

WHEREFORE, plaintiffs pray that this Court:

- a) Adjudge and declare that defendants' acts described above violate plaintiffs' rights under the Eighth and Fourteenth Amendments to the United States Constitution:
- Issue an injunction prohibiting defendants from indiscriminately tear gassing plaintiffs;
- c) Enter judgment against defendants for the sum of \$10,000 (ten thousand dollars) as compensatory damages, and \$10,000 (ten thousand dollars) as punitive damages;
- d) Grant such other and further relief as the Court may deem just and equitable.

Dated: New York, New York April 17, 1974

WILLIAM E. HELLERSTEIN

MARJORIE M. SMITH

PIERCE GERETY, Jr.

Attorneys for Plaintiffs

Legal Aid Society

Prisoners' Rights Project

119 Fifth Avenue

New York, New York

212 - 677 - 4224

Knapp, )

SOUTHERN DESIDENCE OF THE SOUTH SOUTH

PEDRO ARROYO, JERRY THOMAS, CHRISTOPHER ID CORMACK, LANGSTON DENNIS,

Plaintiffs.

-against-

BENJAMIN MALCOLM, Commissioner of Correction of the City of New Mork; ARTUR RIBIN, Marden Manhattan House of Depention for Mon; FLIZZING, For top Deputy Marden in Command; RALPH S MOVIEZ, and FAIRICK MACHER, Assistant Deputy Mardens; MINISTER FIRE MON, COMSTANTINE MINISTER AND PARTICULAR AND PARTICULAR AND ADDRESS OF MARKET AND STREET OF MARKET AND STREET AND S

Defendants.

1 JU. 22125

Consolidated Index No. 72 OIV. 4724

This action having duly some on for trial on the 12th day of July, 1976 become the Ton. Mitman Thans, J.S.D.J., and a jury, and the defendants having moved at the close of the plaintiffs' case for the dismissal of the amended complaint, and mon due consideration theref, it is

ADJUDGED that the amended conclaint on behalf of the plaintiffs THOMAS and DENNIS be and hereby is dismissed for failure to prosecute; and it is further

ADJUDGED that the amended complaint on behalf of the plaintiffs ARROYO and ID CORTHON and against the defendance MALCOLM, RUDIE, SCHALIFER, SUROMITT, MANUEL, FIREJEOU, IELLON, FELTMAN, OCHIANI, WHITH and MARP be and hereby is discussed for the reasons stated by the Court.

BEST COPY AVAILABLE.

NAME OF THE STATE OF THE STATE

Dated: New York, N.I. July 20, 1976

JUDGMENT ENTERED - 7/23/16 Faymond 7. Burghardt

Manther-

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF HEW YORK

PEDRO ARROYO, JERRY THOMAS, CHRISTOPHER MC CORMACK, LANGSTON DENNIS,

Plaintiffs,

-against-

BENJAMIN MALCOLM, Commissioner of Correction of the City of New York; ARTHUR RUBIN, Warden Manhattan House of Detention for Men; PETER M. SCHAEFER, Former Deputy Warden in Command; RALPH SUMOWITZ, and PATRICK MAGNER, Assistant Deputy Wardens; KENNETH FERGUSON, CONSTANTINE MELLON and PAUL FELTMAN, Captains; JOSEPH OCHMANN and ROY SCHUH, Correction Officers; DR. KARP, Institutional Physician; and JOHN DOES #1 - 10, Correction Officers, Manhattan House of Detention for Men,

: NOTICE OF APPEAL

: 72 Civ. 4724 (WK)

Defendants.

- -x

NOTICE is hereby given that PEDRO ARROYO and CHRISTOPHER McCORMACK, plaintiffs above named, hereby appeal to the United States Court of Appeals for the Second Circuit from the final judgment dismissing their amended complaint against defendants SCHAEFER, SUMOWITZ, MAGNER, FERGUSON, MELLON, FELTMAN, OCHMANN, SCHUH and KARP entered in this action on July 23, 1976.

August 18, 1976

WILLIAM E. HELLERSTEIN
MARJORIE M. SMITH
Attorneys for Plaintiffs
The Legal Aid Society
Prisoners' Rights Project
15 Park Row - 19th Floor
New York, New York 10038
[212] 577-3530